



Historic Resource Land Use Review – Approval Criteria, Findings, and Recommendations 1620 SE Waverly Drive, Milwaukie, Oregon

Prepared for:
City of Milwaukie, Oregon
November 14, 2024

Description of the Historic Resource Land Use Review Application

The updated proposed work includes the addition of a primary wing located on the east side of the residence, the addition of a 306 sq. ft. prefabricated conservatory at the southwest side of the residence, extending the west garage wall 6 feet, and extending the south kitchen and nook walls 8.5 feet and 6 feet respectively. The total first floor additions including the conservatory is 1,436 sq. ft. A lanai and porch are proposed for the northwest corner of the house. The primary entrance column on the north elevation is proposed to extend outward just over six feet.

On the second floor, the updated proposed work includes wall extensions proposed on the east wall at the existing bath, the south wall, and west wall. Other additions to the second floor include a deck to the northwest and south. The roof of the main body of the house will remain the same height as it exists today. A hip roof is proposed for the east wing addition. Other proposed roofs maintain the existing roof slopes and do not exceed the existing maximum height.

The existing north, primary elevation, is proposed to retain some of the original building design. Changes include the design and visual qualities of some replacement windows; the design of the pediments above the second-floor windows on the west wing and the addition of a belt course; and the extension of the primary entrance column.

Description of the Historic Context and Significance of the Property

Owned by William MacMaster, this home was constructed in 1922 by the Drake-Voss Construction Company as the family's second estate within Waverly. William moved to Oregon in 1883 from Scotland as a financial representative of the Dundee Land Company. He later formed a real estate investment firm with A.H. Birrell in 1890, buying out Birrell in 1903. William co-owned the firm with his son in law beginning in 1922, renaming it to MacMaster and Ireland until William's death. During his lifetime, William was president of the Arlington Club, president of Waverly twice, and president of the Portland Chamber of Commerce twice. Annie MacMaster was the head for all of the YMCA's Pacific Northwest women's war work during World War I.

Character-defining features of this Colonial Revival home as mentioned in the 1988 Cultural Resource Inventory are as follows:

- Primary entrance with paired paneled doors, Swan's neck pediment, full entablature, and Ionic pilasters.
- Stucco exterior cladding
- Quoining, also made of stucco

- Polygonal bays
- End wall chimney
- Palladian window
- Full-height polygonal bay window with tent roof and spandrel
- Belt course above heads of second story windows
- Rectangular plan flanked by two smaller wings on side elevations

As defined by the National Park Service, a Character Defining Feature is a prominent or distinctive aspect, quality, physical feature, or characteristic that contributes significantly to the visual character of a resource. Character Defining Features are character-defining elements that include the overall shape of the building or resource, the materials used in building the resource, the craftsmanship of the resource, the resource's decorative details, the interior spaces and architectural features, and the site and environment of a resource, also known as its context. There are four zones in regards to character-defining features: High, Medium, and Low Preservation Priority, and Non-Historic.

High Preservation Priority features are the most character-defining features of the building that best convey the significant themes associated with the building. These features are to be maintained and preserved. Alterations to finishes may be acceptable, although the form and overall design should be retained. Work to high priority features will be closely reviewed. High Preservation Priority spaces can be public or private with a high level of integrity and history of architectural finishes and features that include original materials or details of highly skilled craftsmanship. Architectural finishes and features should be preserved. Regarding 1620 SE Waverly Drive, the highest priority features are ones visible from the public right of way, including all features comprising original and proposed north elevations, and other elevations that are visible from the public right of way.

Medium Preservation Priority features help to convey the significance of the building, but are not crucial character-defining features. If a Medium Preservation Priority feature were to be removed, the building would still retain its significance, although some unique aspects may be lost. Often, the overall design aspect of the feature is of medium priority, while the finishes or materials may be of a lower priority. Work to medium priority features require design review and may elicit some commentary although contemporary methods, materials, and designs may be sensitively incorporated. The overall project should reach a balance of retaining some Medium Preservation Priority features to allow for alterations to other medium priority features. Alterations should be compatible with the overall historic character of the building. Medium Preservation Priority spaces can be public or private with a moderate level of integrity and history of architectural finishes and features that include original materials or details but are less ornate than High Preservation Priority spaces in overall character. Architectural finishes and features should be preserved. Regarding 1620 SE Waverly Drive, medium priority features are ones not visible from the public right of way, including all features comprising original and proposed south elevations, and other elevations that are not visible from the public right of way.

Low Preservation Priority features are part of the building design, but have little historic character or contribution to the historic significance of the building. Low priority features include service spaces, heavily-altered features, or additions not associated with the period of significance. Alterations to Low Preservation Priority features, while sympathetic to the historic qualities and character of the building,

may incorporate extensive changes or total replacement through the introduction of contemporary methods, materials, and designs. Proposed work to Low Preservation Priority features will still be reviewed in order to monitor the impact to the overall character and significance of the building. Low Preservation Priority spaces are often not public areas but can be private spaces with minimal integrity and history of architectural finishes and features that contain few or no architectural features that need to be preserved or restored as part of a rehabilitation project. Regarding 1620 SE Waverly Drive, there are no low priority features on the exterior of the building. Since the 1988 Cultural Resource Inventory, no significant exterior changes that have required Historic Resource Land Use Review have been made to the building and, to the best of our knowledge, the building retains all of its significant historic character-defining features.

Non-historic features include architectural features or finishes that are not original to the historic building. Non-historic features primarily include walls and doors that are not considered historic, as well as other features that have been changed or added to the building after initial construction. These elements can be removed and altered with minimal care given to minimize impact. Within the City of Milwaukie, certain alterations to historic buildings do not need to be reviewed through the Historic Resource Land Use Review system. These alterations include the repair or replacement of roof materials either in kind or with similar materials, the application of storm windows, etc. While these changes may have been added to 1620 SE Waverly Drive, there are no other non-historic features of finishes present on the building.

Approval Criteria

Milwaukie Zoning Ordinance Title 19, Chapter 19.400 Overlay Zones and Special Areas governs the “identification, protection, enhancement, perpetuation, and use of site, structures, districts, objects, and buildings within the City that reflect the City’s unique architectural, archaeological, and historical heritage, and to facilitate preservation of such properties.” Any exterior alteration of a “significant” landmark is reviewed under the provisions of Subsection 19.403.5, Alterations and Development, and application is submitted to the City of Milwaukie Planning Commission. The criteria are listed with a response and findings for each, below.

Findings

Findings of the review are based on analyzing and comparing the new materials that were resubmitted as part of the Historic Resource Land Use Review Application, the historic context and significance of the property, and the approval criteria. In PMA's professional opinion, at a minimum to secure approval for this design, the north-facing, primary elevation of the home should preserve all historic materials, design elements, and overall composition. The proposed east and west wings should be designed to harmonize with the existing historic structure, maintaining consistency in materials, design, and composition. This includes retaining the design and composition of the dormers and pediments on the west wing.

1. Retention of Original Construction

Distinguishing original qualities defining a resource's character shall not be destroyed. Removal or alteration of historic materials or distinctive architectural features should be avoided when possible.

The resubmitted project materials propose to redesign the front elevation of the building, which includes the primary entrance column to extend outward over six feet. This change would cause the removal of high preservation priority character-defining features and distinguishing original qualities that define the resource's character as described in the 1988 Cultural Resource Inventory documentation. These features include the stucco quoining and stucco cladding. Additionally, other character-defining features that are proposed to change in design include the pediments above the second story west wing windows and new window designs throughout the primary elevation. This criterion is therefore not met.

In order to meet this criterion, the character-defining qualities of the entire primary, north, elevation should remain as they currently exist. This includes the primary entrance block and existing window designs in order to retain their historic design elements and remain in place as they have historically. The primary entrance block should remain flush with the north elevation and window size and design should match that of the historic size and design. The windows and associated pediments on the west wing should match in composition and design to that of the historic. The resubmitted materials include the addition of a belt course on the west wing. This design element is not historically accurate to this wing of the home.

Per the approval criteria, the removal of high preservation priority character-defining features should be avoided when possible. Changes to character defining features as listed in the 1988 Cultural Resource Inventory documentation on primary, north elevations and elevations visible from the public right of way should be avoided. Removal or manipulation of these features will create a home that is near unrecognizable compared to the original and will therefore become an inaccurate representation of the historic building. On the primary, north elevations, replace as needed due to deterioration. Other historic materials or distinctive architectural features that are medium preservation priority features not on the north elevations or not visible from the public right of way and are not mentioned as part of the 1988 Cultural Resource Inventory documentation may be removed or altered, as long as the alterations reflect a simplified style or simplified Colonial Revival style in order to distinguish the new changes from the original.

2. Building Height

Existing building heights should be maintained. Alteration of roof pitches shall be avoided. Raising or lowering a building's permanent elevation when constructing a foundation shall be avoided, except as required by building code or floodplain development permit.

The first page of the plan set labeled "EKLUND SET 11.7.24" shows a hip roof proposed for the existing east wing. Other plan drawings show the flat roof will remain as it has historically for this wing. The proposal shows roof alterations on the main portion and west wing of the home. The roof height of the main core of the home and the west wing will be maintained. The plan set shows the addition of three pediments on the second floor of the west wing that will not maintain design to

that of the historic existing two pediments. The building's permanent elevation will remain as is and no new foundation under the existing home will be built. This criterion has not been fully addressed and is not yet met.

In order to meet this criterion, the following should be maintained:

- Ensure the retention of the flat roof on the existing east wing of the home;
- Ensure the retention of historic design and composition of the two existing pediments above windows on the west wing of the home;
- Retention of the flat roof above the two-story bay window on the north elevation;
- Retention of the pediment above the front entry design sequence;
- Ensure that the proposed addition and extension of walls at the garage, kitchen and kitchen nook, and east wing will not alter the pitch of the roof to which they are attached; and
- Ensure that no new roof height will be taller than the existing tallest roof height of the building.

3. Horizontal Additions

The scale and proportion of building additions, including the relationship of windows to walls, shall be visually compatible with the traditional architectural character of the historic building. Contemporary design for alterations and additions is acceptable if the design respects the building's original design and is compatible with the original scale, materials, and window and door-opening proportions of the building.

The proposed additions and extensions on the west, east, and south elevations are visually compatible with the traditional architectural character and scale of the historic building. No extensions or additions on the north elevations are permitted due to Approval Criteria 1 *Retention of Original Construction*. Although contemporary in design, the design of these additions and alterations, including the overall scale and design of windows and doors respects the building's original design and are compatible with the original scale and window and door-opening proportions of the building. In order to meet this criterion, ensure that the materials of the east addition be visually compatible and respect the original stucco cladding and the Colonial Revival style architecture; ensure the materials of the rear room extensions are visually compatible with that of the historic stucco cladding in order to be visually compatible with the traditional architectural character of the historic building. The design of the new east wing should be revised where the east addition connects with the existing structure. Specifically, the proposed north and south wings of the east addition should be shifted slightly to the east, ensuring that the roofline of this section does not intersect or obscure the historic portion of the building.

4. Windows

Window replacements shall match the visual qualities of original windows as closely as possible. Wood window frames are preferred in meeting this standard. However, if nonwood replacements exhibit similar visual qualities as their wooden counterparts, they may be acceptable. The original number of window panes shall be maintained or restored when replacements are required.

This application proposes to replace or redesign all windows on every elevation. Some of the new windows do not match the visual qualities of the original. Therefore, this criterion is not met.

In order to meet this criterion, window replacements will match the visual qualities and design of the historic windows on the north elevation. The new windows proposed on the first and second floor of the new west wing should match those of the existing historic. Other window replacements or redesigns should match the visual qualities of the original windows. Maintain the existing number of window panes.

5. Restoration Possible

Except where building code precludes it, new additions or alteration to buildings shall be done in such a manner that if such additions or alterations were to be removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the original building could be restored.

As the new alterations are wood frame construction, in theory this criterion is met. The exterior carport, conservatory, lanais, patio, and porch should be built in such a manner that they can be removed in the future. The architect and build team should ensure that the extensions and additions on the east and south elevations and garage are built in such a way that they can be removed and the original form and integrity of the original building can be restored.

6. Signs and Lighting

Signs, lighting, and other appurtenances (such as walls, fences, awnings, and landscaping) shall be visually compatible with the original character of the building.

There is no proposed signage. No lighting was indicated on the exterior primary façade. No elevation or renderings of appurtenances were submitted. Based on no sign, lighting, and other appurtenances submitted, this criterion is met.

7. Time Period Consistency

Buildings shall be recognized as products of their own time. Alterations that have no Historical basis or which seek to create an earlier appearance shall be avoided.

The proposed alterations that are allowable based on other approval criteria are proposed to align with the visual qualities of the historic home and Colonial Revival style architecture. No proposed alterations create a false historical basis or create an earlier appearance. This criterion is met.

8. Visual Integrity/Style

Distinctive stylistic features, such as a line of columns, piers, spandrels, or other primary structural elements, or examples of skilled craftsmanship which characterize a building, shall be maintained or restored as far as is practicable.

The proposed changes to the north elevations and elevations visible to the public right of way do not meet Criterion 1 *Retention of Original Construction* and Criterion 4 *Windows*. Therefore, this criterion is not met. In order to meet this criterion, distinctive stylistic features on the high preservation priority areas of the home, including the north elevations and elevations visible from the public right of way will be maintained or restored if showing signs of deterioration.

9. Replacement or Additional Materials

Whenever possible, deteriorated architectural features shall be repaired rather than replaced. In the event replacement of an existing feature is necessary, or an addition is proposed, new materials should match those of the original building, to the extent possible, in composition, design, color texture, and other visual qualities.

The resubmitted plans include updated materials that match those of the historic home. In order to meet this criterion, ensure all new materials in the proposed additions and extensions, including windows, doors, roofing, cladding, and other detail materials, match those of the original building in composition, design, color, texture, and other visual qualities.

10. Buffering

An appropriate buffer or screen, as provided under Subsection 19.504.6, may be required when a new commercial or industrial improvement or use is proposed on or adjacent to a designated resource, or within or adjacent to an historic district.

There is no new commercial or industrial improvement or use proposed on or adjacent to this home, therefore no buffer or screen is required. This criterion is not applicable.