



Historic Resource Land Use Review – Approval Criteria, Findings, and Recommendations 9712 SE Cambridge Lane, Milwaukie, Oregon

Prepared for:

City of Milwaukie, Oregon

November 14, 2024

Description of the Historic Resource Land Use Review Application

The Historic Resource Land Use Review Application proposes the demolition of the west wing of the home and a near similar addition constructed in the same location. The main, center volume of the home will remain as it has historically, including the following character-defining features of the home: the elongated oriel second floor window with leaded glass, the full-height rectangular bay with brick and mock half-timbering with similar bay on rear elevation, the mock half-timbering throughout the elevations, the recessed front entry with paneled door, the decorative raised brick course, the leaded glass bow window on rear elevation, and the rear entrance and entrance vestibule. The proposed changes to the home will demolish the western wing of the home, including original brick cladding, roofing shingles, curved dormers, curved garage doors, and rectangular-paned windows and rebuilding a near similar addition that extends more westward and southward than the original west wing. The application proposes the following changes to the design of the west addition:

General

- The wood roofing shingles will be replaced in kind.
- The historic brick will be saved and reused on the north elevation of the addition. The remaining brick will be mixed with new, but similar, brick on the west and south elevations.
- The height of the new west wing and garage will be 16 inches higher than the existing, and 12 feet below the peak of the main house. The new addition will have a 12:12 roof pitch matching the existing house.
- New foundation will match the height of the existing foundation.
- All existing windows are wood clad with simulated lead light divisions.
- As a wood frame construction technique, the proposed addition could be removed and the original west wing and garage design rebuilt.
- Landscaping will remain mostly unchanged.
- New exterior lighting, conductor heads, and other distinguishing features will either be refurbished, reused, or replaced with similar materials.
- Eave details, window trim, and other common elements will be replicated.

North Elevation

- The first-floor casement window with 3-over-3 panes is proposed to be replaced with a tri-part window with diamond leading.
- The eastern curved dormer will be replaced in kind and a matching one added directly to the west.

- The original curved dormer on the garage is proposed to be replaced with a steeply pitched hip roof dormer clad with diagonal board.
- The existing weathervane will be reinstalled in its previous location.

West Elevation

- The garages will be replaced with similar design.
- A new hip-roofed dormer will be added to the second floor.
- An entrance and covered porch will be added to the west elevation of the proposed southern extension of the garage area.

South Elevation

- The first-floor entrance door is proposed to be eliminated from this elevation, but proposed to be of similar design and relocated to the southern side of the west elevation.
- The first-floor door and casement window with 3-over-3 panes are proposed to be replaced with a four-part combination floor to ceiling windows with 3-over-6 panes.
- A new tri-part casement window with 3-over-3 panes will be added to the proposed southern extension of the garage area.
- The curved dormer is proposed to be eliminated and in its place the southern extension of the garage area with hip roof.
- The original hipped-roof dormer is proposed to be eliminated and replaced with an extended hip roof dormer with metal roofing, mock half-timbering, and a tri-part casement window with two-over-three panes in the center. The roof will have a 4:12 roof pitch.

Description of the Historic Context and Significance of the Property

Designed by Portland architect Richard Sundleaf in 1941, this home is an example of the Arts and Crafts style and is an important visual anchor to the north periphery of the Waverly neighborhood. Owner and president of nationally known Milwaukie Company Jarman-Williamson Inc., E. Roy Jarman lived in the home. Jarman-Williamson Inc. developed and refined the golf-cart, remaining a leader in the industry for over thirty years and gaining a national prominence. Jarman-Williamson Inc. was sold to Browning Arms Inc. of Morgan, Utah, in 1969.

The 1988 Historic Resource Survey determined the following as important decorative features to this home:

- Brick cladding,
- Elongated oriel second floor window with leaded glass,
- Full-height rectangular bay with brick and mock half-timbering with similar bay on rear elevation,
- Interior brick chimney,
- Mock half-timbering throughout,
- Recessed entry with paneled door,
- Decorative raised brick course,
- Leaded glass bow window on rear elevation,

- Ornamental trees lining the east property line,
- Evergreen hedge lining the frontage,
- Foundation plantings, and
- Small outbuilding located to rear of the house.

Other important features of the home include:

- Rectangular forms of the home capped with steeply pitched hip roofs,
- Curved dormers,
- Curved garage doors,
- Use of rectangular-paned windows throughout, and
- Shingle roof.

Previous changes to the historic home include the removal of the largest chimney stack that served the old, and now replaced, furnaces. A south addition was added to the library in 1996 and a large patio cover added on the south elevation entrance. The proposal states that the original windows have been replaced by a previous owner.

As defined by the National Park Service, a Character Defining Feature is a prominent or distinctive aspect, quality, physical feature, or characteristic that contributes significantly to the visual character of a resource. Character Defining Features are character-defining elements that include the overall shape of the building or resource, the materials used in building the resource, the craftsmanship of the resource, the resource's decorative details, the interior spaces and architectural features, and the site and environment of a resource, also known as its context. There are four zones in regards to character-defining features: High, Medium, and Low Preservation Priority, and Non-Historic.

High Preservation Priority features are the most character-defining features of the building that best convey the significant themes associated with the building. These features are to be maintained and preserved. Alterations to finishes may be acceptable, although the form and overall design should be retained. Work to high priority features will be closely reviewed. High Preservation Priority spaces can be public or private with a high level of integrity and history of architectural finishes and features that include original materials or details of highly skilled craftsmanship. Architectural finishes and features should be preserved. Regarding 9712 SE Cambridge Lane, the highest priority features are ones visible from the public right of way, including all features located on north elevations, and other elevations that are visible from the public right of way.

Medium Preservation Priority features help to convey the significance of the building, but are not crucial character-defining features. If a Medium Preservation Priority feature were to be removed, the building would still retain its significance, although some unique aspects may be lost. Often, the overall design aspect of the feature is of medium priority, while the finishes or materials may be of a lower priority. Work to medium priority features require design review and may elicit some commentary although contemporary methods, materials, and designs may be sensitively incorporated. The overall project should reach a balance of retaining some Medium Preservation Priority features to allow for alterations to other medium priority features. Alterations should be compatible with the overall historic character

of the building. Medium Preservation Priority spaces can be public or private with a moderate level of integrity and history of architectural finishes and features that include original materials or details but are less ornate than High Preservation Priority spaces in overall character. Architectural finishes and features should be preserved. Regarding 9712 SE Cambridge Lane, medium priority features are ones not visible from the public right of way, including all features located on the south elevations, and other elevations that are not visible from the public right of way.

Low Preservation Priority features are part of the building design, but have little historic character or contribution to the historic significance of the building. Low priority features include service spaces, heavily-altered features, or additions not associated with the period of significance. Alterations to Low Preservation Priority features, while sympathetic to the historic qualities and character of the building, may incorporate extensive changes or total replacement through the introduction of contemporary methods, materials, and designs. Proposed work to Low Preservation Priority features will still be reviewed in order to monitor the impact to the overall character and significance of the building. Low Preservation Priority spaces are often not public areas but can be private spaces with minimal integrity and history of architectural finishes and features that contain few or no architectural features that need to be preserved or restored as part of a rehabilitation project. Regarding 9712 SE Cambridge Lane, there are no low priority features on the visible elevations of the building. The south elevation library addition and south patio cover that are new additions to the home are low preservation priority features. Besides these two changes, no other significant exterior changes have been made to the best of our knowledge and the building retains the remaining significant historic character-defining features. The previous additions to the south elevations will not be changed as part of this Historic Resource Land Use Review.

Non-historic features include architectural features or finishes that are not original to the historic building. Non-historic features primarily include walls and doors that are not considered historic, as well as other features that have been changed or added to the building after initial construction. These elements can be removed and altered with minimal care given to minimize impact. Within the City of Milwaukie, certain alterations to historic buildings do not need to be reviewed through the Historic Resource Land Use Review system. These alterations include the repair or replacement of roof materials either in kind or with similar materials, application of storm windows, etc. These changes may have been added to 9712 SE Cambridge Lane in addition to the south elevation library addition and south patio cover that are new additions to the home are non-historic features. The previous additions to the south elevations will not be changed as part of this Historic Resource Land Use Review.

Approval Criteria

Milwaukie Zoning Ordinance Title 19, Chapter 19.400 Overlay Zones and Special Areas governs the “identification, protection, enhancement, perpetuation, and use of site, structures, districts, objects, and buildings within the City that reflect the City’s unique architectural, archaeological, and historical heritage, and to facilitate preservation of such properties.” Any exterior alteration of a “significant”

landmark is reviewed under the provisions of Subsection 19.403.5, Alterations and Development, and application is submitted to the City of Milwaukie Planning Commission. The criteria are listed with a response and findings for each, below.

Findings

Findings of the review are based on analyzing and comparing the materials that were resubmitted as part of the Historic Resource Land Use Review Application, the historic context and significance of the property, and the approval criteria.

1. Retention of Original Construction

Distinguishing original qualities defining a resource's character shall not be destroyed. Removal or alteration of historic materials or distinctive architectural features should be avoided when possible.

This project proposes to demolish and rebuild the western wing of the home, which includes the removal of high preservation priority character-defining features as part of the west wing and a few distinguishing original qualities of the resource's character that are also defined in the 1988 Cultural Resource Inventory documentation. These features include the brick cladding, wood shingle roof, leaded 3-over-3 casement windows, leaded 3-over-4 curved dormers, leaded 2-over-3 hipped dormer, curved garage doors, and foundation plantings. It is proposed to reuse original brick cladding on the north elevation, reinstall a wood shingle roof, rebuild one north elevation curved dormer and curved garage doors, and retain foundation plantings.

Retention of the original construction is not proposed; therefore, this criterion cannot be met with full demolition.

2. Building Height

Existing building heights should be maintained. Alteration of roof pitches shall be avoided. Raising or lowering a building's permanent elevation when constructing a foundation shall be avoided, except as required by building code or floodplain development permit.

This criterion has not been fully addressed and is not yet met. The existing building features roofs with a 12:12 roof pitch and this proposal retains the existing pitch of the main roof. No changes are proposed to be made to the foundation that would influence a building's permanent elevation. The roof height of the addition is proposed to rise, although the new addition will remain shorter than the existing main roof of the home, retaining this composition. Other changes to the south elevation include the proposed dormer on the south elevation with a proposed pitch of 12:4, the roof line of the southern garage extension, and the roofline above the garage pedestrian entrance.

In order to meet this criterion, the overall roof height of the addition should maintain the historic roof height while retaining the 12:12 roof pitch. If all proposed dormers on the north elevations are curved, this would better match the original dormers and meet the criteria, as well as ensuring the

ridge of the south dormer is not visible over the main roof ridge would meet the criteria. Additionally, to better meet the criteria, the roofline of the southern garage extension should be offset and moved westward in order for the roofline behind to be visible, matching the other offset rooflines throughout the home; and redesigning the proposed roof above the garage pedestrian entrance to be flat to match the flat roofline of the south patio cover.

With these updates, this criterion can be met.

3. Horizontal Additions

The scale and proportion of building additions, including the relationship of windows to walls, shall be visually compatible with the traditional architectural character of the historic building. Contemporary design for alterations and additions is acceptable if the design respects the building's original design and is compatible with the original scale, materials, and window and door-opening proportions of the building.

In order to meet this criterion, relocate the addition behind the face of the main house so as to not extend beyond either the north or south elevations of the center volume of the home. The southern garage extension should be offset from the roofline and building behind, and aligning the windows, sills, and eaves of the southern roof dormer with that of the main body of the home will better meet the criteria.

4. Windows

Window replacements shall match the visual qualities of original windows as closely as possible. Wood window frames are preferred in meeting this standard. However, if non-wood replacements exhibit similar visual qualities as their wooden counterparts, they may be acceptable. The original number of window panes shall be maintained or restored when replacements are required.

This application proposes a new west addition with new windows. Many of the new windows are proposed to match the visual qualities of the original windows as closely as possible and meet this criterion.

On the primary, north elevation of the proposed addition, it is recommended that several proposed windows be redesigned in order to better meet this criterion. The proposed first floor, north elevation window is larger and different in design than the historic, therefore not matching the visual quality of the original. The proposed north elevation dormers should also match the visual qualities of the historic. In addition, aligning the height of the windows of the proposed rear, southern dormer with other second floor windows on the main body of the home will better meet the criteria.

5. Restoration Possible

Except where building code precludes it, new additions or alteration to buildings shall be done in such a manner that if such additions or alterations were to be removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the original building could be restored.

As the new addition is wood frame construction, in theory this criterion is met.

6. Signs and Lighting

Signs, lighting, and other appurtenances (such as walls, fences, awnings, and landscaping) shall be visually compatible with the original character of the building.

The 1988 Historic Resource Survey determined the sloping lawn with ornamental plants along the property line and the foundation plantings as noteworthy landscape features to this home. The existing weathervane is proposed to be reinstalled on the same roof intersection as that of the historic building. There is no proposed signage. No lighting was indicated on the exterior primary façade. No elevation or renderings of appurtenances were submitted. The landscaping and weathervane will be retained, and there were no sign, lighting, or other appurtenances submitted.

This criterion is met.

7. Time Period Consistency

Buildings shall be recognized as products of their own time. Alterations that have no Historical basis or which seek to create an earlier appearance shall be avoided.

The proposed alterations that are allowable based on other approval criteria are proposed to align with the visual qualities of the original house and arts and crafts style architecture. No proposed alterations create a false historical basis or create an earlier appearance. This criterion is met.

8. Visual Integrity/Style

Distinctive stylistic features, such as a line of columns, piers, spandrels, or other primary structural elements, or examples of skilled craftsmanship which characterize a building, shall be maintained or restored as far as is practicable.

The distinctive stylistic and high preservation priority features of the home, including the brick cladding, the elongated oriel second floor window with leaded glass, the full-height rectangular bay with brick and mock half-timbering with similar bay on rear elevation, the mock half-timbering throughout, the recessed entry with paneled door, the decorative raised brick course, and the leaded glass bow window on rear elevation, as well as the rectangular forms of the home capped with steeply pitched roofs, curved dormers, curved garage doors, and shingle roof, are proposed to remain or be replaced in similar design. Replace in kind those distinctive elements that are proposed to be replaced as part of the addition. This criterion is met.

9. Replacement or Additional Materials

Whenever possible, deteriorated architectural features shall be repaired rather than replaced. In the event replacement of an existing feature is necessary, or an addition is proposed, new materials should match those of the original building, to the extent possible, in composition, design, color texture, and other visual qualities.

According to the proposal, only historic brick will be reused as the cladding on the north elevation of the addition; the historic brick will be used in tandem with new brick on the west and south elevations of the addition; and the addition will have a shingle roof to match the existing. To fully meet this criterion, match all windows and doors to those of the original building in composition, design, color, texture, and other visual qualities. Clad all proposed dormers in materials that currently exist on the historic home, and introduce no new materials. Materials to be used on the dormers include brick or mock half-timbering for cladding and wood shingle roofing. This criterion is met.

10. Buffering

An appropriate buffer or screen, as provided under Subsection 19.504.6, may be required when a new commercial or industrial improvement or use is proposed on or adjacent to a designated resource, or within or adjacent to an historic district.

There is no new commercial or industrial improvement or use proposed on or adjacent to this home, therefore no buffer or screen is required. This criterion is not applicable.